Regional Exchange on The Internet Universality Indicators

Date: March 16, 2022
Time: 14:00 - 15:45 (EAT)
Global Updates: Implementing UNESCO’s Internet Universality R.O.A.M-X Framework

Xianhong Hu
x.hu@unesco.org
UNESCO's mandate: “free flow of ideas”

Internet => network of socioeconomic interactions & relationships

- Internet must be universal not only in “connecting everyone”, but in being grounded in **UNIVERSAL VALUES** => Human Rights framework, **UN** SG common agenda and digital compact

- Inclusiveness and meaningful access are central to Internet discourse (“digital divides”) => but also affects public policy, equality, media & journalism, cultural diversity, quality education, protection of human rights => meaningfully ACCESSIBLE BY ALL

- Internet development must contribute to the peace and **SDGs** => need evidence to identify achievements and gaps => 303 quantitative and qualitative indicators, in 5 ROAM-X categories + context

Mission de l'UNESCO : "la libre circulation des idées"

Internet => réseau d'interactions et de relations socio-économiques

- L'Internet doit être universel en "connectant tout le monde" et fondé sur des **VALEURS UNIVERSELLES** => cadre des Droits de l'Homme.

- L'inclusion est au cœur du discours sur l'Internet ("fossés numériques") => ACCESSIBLE PAR TOUS

- Le développement de l'Internet doit contribuer aux **ODD** => besoin de preuves pour identifier les réussites et les lacunes => 303 indicateurs quantitatifs et qualitatifs, dans 5 catégories DOAM-X + contexte
### VALUES

- Respect, protection and promotion of human dignity, **human rights** and fundamental freedoms
- Environment and ecosystem flourishing
- Ensuring diversity and inclusiveness
- Living in peaceful, just and interconnected societies

### PRINCIPLES

- Proportionality and do no harm
- Safety and security
- Fairness and non-discrimination
- Sustainability
- **Privacy and Data Protection**
- Human oversight and determination
- Transparency and explainability
- Responsibility and accountability
- Awareness and literacy
- **Multi-stakeholder** and adaptive governance and collaboration
303 Indicators in 5 categories + context and 31 different themes (109 core ones)

- (21) Contextual indicators
- (55) Human Rights
- (57) Openness
- (70) Inclusive Access
- (21) Multi-stakeholder approach
- (79) X Cross-cutting Issues

303 Indicateurs dans 5 categories + contexte et 31 themes différents (dont 109 essentiels)

Ø (21) Indicateurs Contextuels
Ø (55) Droit de l'Homme
Ø (57) Ouverture
Ø (70) Accessibilité
Ø (21) Approche Multipartite
Ø (79) X Questions transversales

- Full publication and Summary Leaflets
  - [English](https://en.unesco.org/internet-universality-indicators)
  - [French](https://fr.unesco.org/internet-universality-indicators)
  - [Spanish](https://es.unesco.org/internet-universality-indicators)
  - [Chinese](https://zh.unesco.org/internet-universality-indicators)
  - [Russian](https://ru.unesco.org/internet-universality-indicators)
  - [Arabic](https://ar.unesco.org/internet-universality-indicators)
## 5 Categories, each with Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Theme A</th>
<th>Theme B</th>
<th>Theme C</th>
<th>Theme D</th>
<th>Theme E</th>
<th>Theme F</th>
<th>Cross-Cutting Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rights</td>
<td>Policy, legal and regulatory framework</td>
<td>Freedom of expression</td>
<td>Right of access to information</td>
<td>Freedom of association and the right to take part in public affairs</td>
<td>The right to privacy</td>
<td>Social, economic and cultural rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Policy, legal and regulatory framework</td>
<td>Open standards</td>
<td>Open markets</td>
<td>Open content</td>
<td>Open data and open government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Equitable access</td>
<td>Local content and language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capacities/competencies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sustainable development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trust and security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Legal and ethical aspects of the Internet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**UNESCO**

Steering AI for Knowledge Societies: A ROAM Perspective
How could ROAM-X contribute and complement?

Unique strength of ROAM-X: as an endorsed position and holistic framework

- A UNESCO endorsed position and holistic framework, not for ranking
- An overarching measurement on legal, policy and regulatory framework
- Unique strength in measuring human rights and Multi-stakeholder approach
- A clear focus on digital inclusion dimensions (gender, youth, people with disabilities, language, local content)
- Methodological/process innovation of a multi-stakeholder implementation to empower national actors and create consensus
- **Solid evidence** based approach

- Une position approuvée par l'UNESCO et un cadre holistique, non destiné à être classé.
- Une évaluation globale du cadre juridique, politique et réglementaire.
- Une force unique dans la mesure des droits de l'Homme et une approche multipartite.
- Un accent clair sur les dimensions d'inclusion numérique (genre, jeunesse, personnes handicapées, langue, contenu local).
- **Innovation méthodologique/processus** d'une mise en œuvre multipartite pour responsabiliser les acteurs nationaux et créer un consensus.
- Approche fondée sur des données probantes
How are ROAM-X indicators assessed at national level

1. **Establishing a Multistakeholder Advisory Board (role of MAB?)**
2. **Building a collaborative research team (the composition?)**
3. Developing a research action plan,
4. Data gathering
5. Data analysis
6. **Report-writing and recommendations**
7. **Organizing a national validation multistakeholder workshop**
8. **Impact assessment and monitoring**

---

- Peer reviews (national and international levels)
- Publishing process: UNESCO Series of Internet Universality Indicators Assessments
- To translate Recommendations to Actions and changes
- Regular update of assessments (and indicators)

---

1. Établir un conseil consultatif multipartite (rôle du MAB ?)
2. Constituer une équipe de recherche collaborative (sa composition ?)
3. Développer un plan d'action de recherche
4. **Collecte** de données
5. **Analyse** des données
6. Rédaction du rapport et **recommandations**
7. Organisation d'un atelier national de validation multipartite
8. **Évaluation et suivi de l'impact**

---

- Examens par les pairs (niveaux national et international)
- Processus de publication : Série UNESCO d'évaluations des indicateurs d'universalité de l'Internet
- Traduire les recommandations en actions et en changements
- Mise à jour régulière des évaluations (et des indicateurs)
45 countries: ROAM-X assessments since 2019

- **AFRICA (17)**: Benin, Senegal, Kenya, Ghana, Niger, Ethiopia, Cote d’Ivoire, Cabo Verde, Burkina Faso, Namibia, Tanzania, Gambia, Cameroon, Burundi, Gabon, Congo RC, Congo RDC

- **ASIA(14)**: Thailand, Nepal, Pakistan, Uzbekistan, Cambodia, Mongolia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Tuvalu, Tonga, Fiji, Solomon Islands, Vanuatu

- **ARAB STATES(4)**: Tunisia, Sudan, Jordan, Palestine

- **LATIN AMERICA(6)**: Brazil, Ecuador, Paraguay, Uruguay, Argentina, Dominican Republic

- **EUROPE(4)**: Germany, France, Serbia, Bulgaria

ROAM-X in Africa: to scale up

During 2019-2022, ROAM-X progressed in 17 countries in Africa was formulated:

- **Completed**: Benin, Senegal, Kenya
- **Ongoing**: Ghana, Niger, Ethiopia, Cote d’Ivoire, Cabo Verde, Burkina Faso,
- **To be launched**: Namibia, Tanzania, Gambia, Cameroon, Burundi, Gabon, Congo RC, Congo RDC

Pendant 2019-2022, DOAM-X sous évaluation dans 17 pays d’Afrique:

- **Achevé** : Bénin, Sénégal, Kenya
- **En cours** : Ghana, Niger, Éthiopie, Côte d’Ivoire, Cabo Verde, Burkina Faso.
- **A venir** : Namibie, Tanzanie, Gambie, Cameroun, Burundi, Gabon, Congo RC, Congo RDC.

- Group assessments at sub-regional levels
- Meta analysis at regional and global levels
The creation of the Multistakeholder Advisory Board is the first step necessary to carry out the assessment.
Multistakeholder validation workshops

Sénégal

Bénin

Uruguay

Sudan

Kenya

Paraguay
### The IGF Dynamic Coalition on ROAM-X

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholder Group</th>
<th>Stakeholder</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government/public institutions</strong></td>
<td>• Polish National Commission for UNESCO&lt;br&gt;• German National Commission for UNESCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IGOs</strong></td>
<td>• Council of Europe&lt;br&gt;• Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Civil Society/individuals</strong></td>
<td>• Association of Progressive Communications&lt;br&gt;• Missions Publiques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academia</strong></td>
<td>• CETIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Private Sector and Technical Community</strong></td>
<td>• Internet Society (ISOC)&lt;br&gt;• Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)&lt;br&gt;• NIC.br</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Media</strong></td>
<td>• Global Forum for Media Development (GFMD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multi-stakeholder organizations</strong></td>
<td>• Global Network Initiative (GNI), I and J</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Join the DC on IUIs/ Rejoignez la Coalition Dynamique des IUIs: [https://en.unesco.org/feedback/join-our-internet-universality-community](https://en.unesco.org/feedback/join-our-internet-universality-community)

For other queries, please contact: [internet.indicators@unesco.org](mailto:internet.indicators@unesco.org)
Thank you! Merci!

- Xianhong Hu – UNESCO IUIs Focal Point: x.hu@unesco.org
- Internet Universality Indicators: https://en.unesco.org/internetuniversality
- IGF Dynamic Coalition of Internet Universality Indicators:
  - https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/dc-on-internet-universality-indicators-dc-iui
Assessing the Ethiopian Internet Development: Awareness Creation & Lessons Learnt

By
Asrat Mulatu (Ph.D.)
March 2022
Addis Ababa Science and Technology University
Addis Ababa
Ethiopia
Presentation Outline

• Brief Introduction about UNESCO ROAM-X IUIs
• Simplified Steps We Followed
• Opportunities and Challenges in the Process
• Lessons Learnt
Brief Introduction about UNESCO ROAM-X IUls

- It contains
  - 6 categories
  - 25 themes
  - 124 questions
  - 303 indicators
    - 109 core indicators
    - 55 R + 57 O + 70 A + 21 M + 79 X + 21 N/C
  - International Sources
- A Framework to Assess National Internet Development
Simplified Steps We Followed

• Job Division among Team Members
  • Questionnaire and Interview Items Preparation
  • Team leaders and members
  • Data Collection
  • Letter dissemination
  • Questionnaire
  • Interview
  • Direct Observation
  • Group Discussions

• Job Division among Team Members
  • Questionnaire and Interview Items Preparation
  • Team leaders and members
  • Data Collection
  • Letter dissemination
  • Questionnaire
  • Interview
  • Direct Observation
  • Group Discussions
Simplified Steps We Followed (cont.)

• Data Analysis and Interpretation
  • Data organization
  • Data filtering
  • Data rearrangement
  • Data analysis
  • Data presentation

• Write Up
  • Narration of concepts and ideas
  • Interpretation against national context and realities

• Proof reading
  • Expert feedback
Opportunities and Challenges in the Process

• Opportunities
  • Well designed framework & clear ToR
  • Strong core team
  • Conducive working area
    • AI & Robotics CoE
  • PI become ICT Director of AASTU
  • Strong national contextual understanding
  • Wider acquaintances and networks
  • Identification of national ICT related problems/challenges
    • Already one project proposal is developed

• Challenges
  • Establishment of new government
    • New officials
    • New offices
    • New structure – splitting & merging
  • Internal Conflict
    • International relations
  • Institutional Fund Administration
  • Response rates
  • Respondent misunderstandings
  • Lack of organized national data repository
  • Misunderstanding of Questions and Indicators
Lessons Learnt

• Start as early as possible & Be consistent
• Establish a strong & diversified core team with good know-how of ICT
• Share responsibilities
• Use personal acquaintances informally & also formal approaches
• Start building from what you get (data)
• Make regular discussions (brainstorming sessions) among teams
• Design the financial breakdown as per internal financial guidelines

• Project management is very key
ขอขอบคุณค่ะ!
Backup Slide - Current Status

• Draft final report generated
• Waiting for some feedbacks
• Waiting for national validation workshop
Regional Exchange on The Internet Universality Indicators (IUIs)

ETHIOPIA: ASSESSING INTERNET DEVELOPMENT

Ethiopia National Experience

Aderaw Genetu Tassew
ag.tassew@unesco.org
Methodology: 8 Action Steps (lessons learned)

1. Establishing a Multistakeholder Advisory Board (role of MAB?)
2. Building a collaborative research team (the composition?)
3. Developing a research action plan,
4. Data gathering
5. Data analysis
6. Report-writing and recommendations
7. Organizing a national validation multistakeholder workshop
8. Impact assessment and monitoring

- Peer reviews (national and international levels)
- Publishing process: UNESCO Series of Internet Universality Indicators Assessments
- To translate Recommendations to Actions and changes
- Regular update of assessments (and indicators)
Minister of Ministry of MInT Ethiopia and UNESCO ADG CI
May 2019, Addis Ababa
• UNESCO presenting the IUI and discussing with the government and key stakeholders on implementation
The Multistakeholder Advisory Board (MAB)

The creation of the Multistakeholder Advisory Board is the first step and necessary in every step of the completion of the national assessment.
The Multistakeholder Advisory Board (MAB)

The creation of the Multistakeholder Advisory Board is the first step and necessary in every step of the completion of the national assessment.
Lessons and challenges

- Start with key stakeholders
- Engage the government at the beginning
- Align it with national priorities
- Making sure it is multi stakeholder approach
Thank you!

Aderaw Genetu Tassew

ag.tassew@unesco.org
Ghana: National Assessment of Internet Universality Indicators

UNESCO and CIPESA's IUIs Session

Dr. Gideon Mensah Anapey (Team Member)
Dr. Simon-Peter Kafui Aheto (Team Lead)

MAB - GH
16th March 2022
Stakeholder Engagements

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
Objectives of the national assessment

• To develop a clear and substantive understanding of national Internet environment and policies
• To assess national Internet environment and policies in relation to ROAM principles
• To formulate policy recommendations and practical initiatives
Methods

• Inception meetings with MAB
• Key informant interviews
  • FGDs
• Desk Reviews
• National Cluster Surveys (GSS)
Ghana has the requisite laws to **govern the Internet ecosystem** and give essence to the needed rights online (DPA, Cybersecurity, RTI Acts). She has also signed and ratified a number of conventions that relate to rights.

- The regulatory regime operates within the laws.
- There is no policy on Free and Open Source Software and OERs.
- Accessibility remains a challenge among certain category of people i.e. disability groups and women.

- Multistakeholder consultations are used in policy development.
- Much can be done when it comes to disaggregation of data on children and women.
- Generally, there is an awareness of the Internet Ecosystem and some of its regulations by the public.
Constitution: Chapter 5 of the 1992 Constitution deals with human rights issues:
  - Art. 18(2): Protection of Privacy
  - Art. 21: Fundamental freedoms (speech and expression, thought, conscience and belief, association), Right to information

Chp. 12: Freedom and independence of media Chp. 18, CHRAJ

Subsidiary legislations: Cybersecurity Act; NCA Act; Data Protection Act, NMC Act, RTI Act.

International Framework: Ghana is a member and ratified AU and UN Conventions on HR

No internet shutdown or blocking

Freedom of organization online (Online movements and pressure groups)


Challenges: Right to access Information—Bureaucratic when it comes to government agencies; Aggregated/disaggregated data; data availability; Fewer capacity building initiatives and research
Figure 16: NCA’s Regional Disaggregated Mobile Phones Households Survey
GAPS

R – Anecdotal reports on HR abuses of journalists. Perceived attacks on journalists.

O – Affordances of the Internet services [cost of data viz-a-viz specific usage].**

A – Functional digital literacy skill gap.

M – Lack of Information sharing leading to duplication of projects.

X – Disaggregated data on the marginalized [Gender, locations, disability, inclusion]

M&E for attainment of SDG in relation to the Internet
DATA RELATED GAPS

Categories of Human Right abuses complained to CHRAJ from 2016 to 2019

- Children's Rights
- Women's Rights
- Property Rights
- Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
- Civil and Political Rights

Source: CHRAJ’s 23-26th Annual Reports

CHRAJ: Human Rights complaints received and concluded from 2016 to 2019

Dis/Aggregated data

Sources: CHRAJ’s 23-26th Annual Reports
How could more countries from the West African region initiate the ROAM-X indicators assessment?

• Capacity Building for member countries (the Ghana Team is strong enough to support this process)

• Key team members should cover experts in ICT integration, legal frameworks, public policy analyses, Understanding of the SDG Goals (Inclusivity)

• Deepen awareness on ROAM-X
○ Advocacy
○ Research
○ Policy recommendations
THANK YOU