# ICT in Governance in Tanzania – Policies and Practice CIPESA ICT Research Series No. 07/15 October 2015

This report reviews government and non-government Information and Communication Technology (ICT) initiatives in Tanzania, and examines how ICT-related policies and other legislation affect citizen participation and democratic governance. Among others, the study covers the link between ICT and political participation, social accountability, public services delivery and citizen engagement. The report is based on policy analysis, stakeholder interviews and literature review, and aims to inform awareness raising initiatives and advocacy for more progressive policies and practices regarding the use of ICT in governance and civic participation in Tanzania.

This report was produced by the Collaboration on International ICT Policy for East and Southern Africa (CIPESA) in the context of the ICT4Democracy in East Africa (<a href="www.ict4democracy.org">www.ict4democracy.org</a>) initiative with support from the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida).

The CIPESA team acknowledges Edison Wazoel Lubua who was a contributing author on the Tanzania report. Similar reports have been written for Kenya and Uganda.



# **Table of Contents**

1. Introduction	3
1.1 Status of ICT in Tanzania	3
2. ICT-Related Laws and Policies	
3. ICT in Governance	6
3.1 ICT and Citizen Participation	ε
3.2 ICT and Social Accountability	8
3.3 ICT in Politics	10
3.4. ICT, Human Rights and Law Enforcement	11
4. Challenges to the Use of ICT in Governance	12
5. Recommendations	
References	15

#### 1. Introduction

Contemporary Tanzania is the result of the 1964 union between the Zanzibar islands and Tanganyika. Until 1992, the country was governed under an autocratic system. Since then, five general elections have been held under multipartism: in 1995, 2000, 2005, 2010 and 2015. In the October 2015 elections, John Pombe Magufuli of the rulling party Chama Cha Mapinduzi was elected president.

There have, however, been reports of malpractice unethical behaviour in past elections. In the 2010 general election, the opposition party Chama cha Demokrasia na Maendeleo (CHADEMA) refused to acknowledge presidential results stating that the elections were not free and fair and lacked transparency. The police was accused of brutally breaking up opposition rallies. In one incident, Daudi Mwangosi, a local television journalist, was killed while covering a CHADEMA event.

However, the government has taken strides in promoting transparency and citizens' participation in decision making processes, including through the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT). On May 1, 2012, the government formed the Tanzania Constitutional Review Commission (TCRC)<sup>3</sup> to enable citizens to actively participate in the redrafting of the Constitution. The commission was a product of the Constitutional Review Act of 2011.<sup>4</sup> Increasingly, online polling is exercised by many Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) using web-based tools to solicit citizens' opinion to inform decision making processes.

#### 1.1 Status of ICT in Tanzania

As of September 2015, Tanzania reported a telephone penetration of 71% with 11.36 million internet users. There are five telecom companies with Vodacom, Airtel and Tigo taking the largest market share, followed by Zantel and Tanzania Telecommunications Company (TTCL).

In 2001, the Southern African Development Community (SADC), of which Tanzania is a member, made a Declaration on ICT recognising that "the SADC needs a coherent regional policy in ICT, which promotes sustainable economic development." Two years later, the Tanzanian government enacted its National ICT Policy (2003), which proposed the use of ICT to attain sustainable socio-economic development for accelerated poverty reduction. The Tanzania Development Vision 2025 reinforces this policy with a more current approach, such

http://www.theguardian.com/media/greenslade/2012/sep/03/journalist-safety-tanzania

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Commonwealth Observer Group, Tanzania General Elections 2010, http://aceproject.org/ero-en/regions/africa/TZ/tanzania-interim-statement-general-elections-the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Tanzanian TV Journalist Killed,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Tanzania's Constitutional Review: A New Era for the Union?,

http://www.comparativeconstitutions.org/2012/07/tanzanias-constitutional-review-new-era.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The Constitutional Review Act (2011), http://www.policyforum-

tz.org/files/Constitution Review Act 2011.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Quarterly Communications Statistics Report, July- September 2015 Quarter, <a href="http://www.tcra.go.tz/images/documents/telecommunication/telcomStatsSept15.pdf">http://www.tcra.go.tz/images/documents/telecommunication/telcomStatsSept15.pdf</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Tanzania National ICT Plicy 2003, <a href="http://www.mst.go.tz/index.php/joomlaorg/national-ict-policy-2003">http://www.mst.go.tz/index.php/joomlaorg/national-ict-policy-2003</a>



as through the use of integrated financial mamanegmnt systems (IFMS) but fails to make explicit mention of ICT as a key development enabler.<sup>7</sup>

In 2012, the Universal Communication Services Access Fund (UCSAF) begun supporting access to ICT in rural areas. The fund is supported by 1.5% of telecom operators' annual revenue. Established under the Universal Communications Service Access Act of 2006, UCSAF's key objective is "to foster social and economic development in rural and urban areas through ICT intervention."8 In 2013, the fund awarded four telecom companies contracts to connect 316 villages. In 2014, an additional 86 wards were identified to receive connectivity through the fund. 10

The National ICT Backbone (NICTBB)<sup>11</sup> which extends from Dar es Salaam to mainland Tanzania covers approximately 7,560 kms. Currently, the backbone covers 24 regions of Tanzania's mainland, and is connected to the East African Marine System (TEAMS), the Sea Cable System (Seacom), the Eastern Africa Submarine Cable System (EASSy) and the Lower Indian Ocean Network 2 (LION2). It also has cross-border connectivity to neighbouring Kenya, Uganda, Rwanda, Malawi, Burundi and Zambia. 12

In an effort to boost the use of ICT in the country, tax exemptions were introduced under Article 19 of the second schedule of the Value Added Tax Act (2006), exempting taxes on the supply and importation of electronics identified as "computers, printers, and accessories connected to the computer.<sup>13</sup>

More than 70% of the Tanzanian population lacks reliable access to power.<sup>14</sup> This has hampered access to online services despite Section 5 of the Tanzania Communication Regulatory Authority Act (2003) requiring the authority to "enhance the welfare of consumers of communication services through promoting the availability of regulated services to all consumers including low income, rural areas and other disadvantaged groups."

At the regional level, the East African Community (EAC) resolved to use ICT in promoting the development of partner states. A guiding document known as a Protocol on Regional

http://www.mof.go.tz/mofdocs/overarch/THE%20TANZANIA%20DEVELOPMENT%20VISION%202025.

https://www.telegeography.com/products/commsupdate/articles/2013/03/11/tanzanian-telcos-inkucsaf-contract-to-improve-rural-access/

http://www.thecitizen.co.tz/Business/Sh13bn-telecoms-deal-signed-to-serve-4550-000-ruralresidents/-/1840414/2289234/-/15cywa4z/-/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Tanzania Development Vision 2025,

<sup>8</sup> Universal Communication Services Access Fund, <a href="http://www.ucaf.go.tz/index.htm">http://www.ucaf.go.tz/index.htm</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Tanzania Telcos Ink UCSAF Contract to Improve Rural Access,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Sh13bn telecoms deal signed to serve 4550,000 rural residents,

<sup>11</sup> Tanzania, National ICT Backbone, http://www.nictbb.co.tz/about.php?in=nictbb

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Minister of Communications, Science and Technology, November 14, 2014, <a href="http://www.the-number.nd/">http://www.the-number.nd/</a> report.net/tanzania/nov2014/1166-interview-professor-makame-mbarawa-minister-of-<u>communications-science-and-technology: Accessed on 8 Apri 2015</u>
<sup>13</sup> Value Added Tax Act (2006),

http://www.tra.go.tz/tax%20laws/The%20Value%20Added%20Tax%20Act,%201997.pdf <sup>14</sup> Status of the Energy Sector in Tanzania, <a href="http://www.usea.org/sites/default/files/event-">http://www.usea.org/sites/default/files/event-</a> /Tanzania%20Power%20Sector.pdf



Information and Communication Technology (PRICT) was instituted.<sup>15</sup> Although the document has a number of objectives, it generally aims at stirring the socio-economic development of the partner states through ICT. Article 3.4 of the protocol requires member states to undertake necessary measures to harmonise legal issues to support the implementation and uses of ICT for enhanced governance of the people.

#### 2. ICT-Related Laws and Policies

Despite efforts demonstrated by the government through the formulation of legislation in favour of ICT use, there remain other laws which inhibit and contradict progressive legislation. Some of these laws date as far back as the 1970's and negatively impact meaningful citizen participation, the free flow of information, access to information and freedom of expression.

Article 18(b) of the Constitution of Tanzania gives every citizen the "right to seek, receive and, or disseminate information, regardless of national boundaries." However, Section 5 (1) of the National Security Act (1970) gives government officials the power to withhold information from citizens stating: "Any person who communicates any classified matter to any person other than a person to whom he is authorized to communicate it, shall be guilty of an offence."

The Newspapers Act (1976)<sup>16</sup> is another legislation which affects information sharing. Section 25 (1) of the Act grants the minister in charge the power to prohibit the publication of a newspaper, if s/he is of the opinion that it is in the public interest or in the interest of peace and good order.<sup>17</sup> The clause gives the government the power to assume two positions at the same time – that of a complainant and judge.

Moreover, the Tanzania Prevention of Terrorism Act of 2002 allows for the interception of communications. In section 31 (1) of the fifth part of the Act, a police officer is given the authority to intercept and retain communications transmitted through any electronic medium with the help of service providers. Also, the Act gives law enforcement agencies the authority to install monitoring devices on any premise to obtain information needed for security purposes. This consequently influences the free flow of information due to the perceived threat of privacy intrusion.

Arguably, amid the presence of a stable National ICT Backbone, exemptions for importation of computers, and over 10 years of the existence of the National ICT Policy, citizens have not fully enjoyed the benefits that come with the use of ICT. Youth, women and other disadvantaged groups are less empowered because of low access to ICT and to information.

The Cybercrimes Act (2015)<sup>19</sup> threatens human rights through granting excessive police power, high penalities and the crimilisation of actions which fall under freedom of expression and access to information as seen in Section 16 which states:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> The Draft Protocol On The Establishment Of The East African Science And Technology Council, http://www.education.eac.int/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=66&Itemid=139

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Tanzania Newspapers Act, 1976, http://polis.parliament.go.tz/PAMS/docs/3-1976.pdf

 $<sup>^{17}</sup>$  Where the Minister is of the opinion that it is in the public interest or in the interest of peace and good order- s/he may direct that the newspaper named in the order shall cease publication -

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> A police officer may, for the purpose of obtaining evidence of the commission of an offence under this Act, apply, exparte, to the Court, for an interception of communications order.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Tanzania Cybercrime Act 2015, http://www.parliament.go.tz/polis/PAMS/docs/1-2015-4.pdf



"Any person who publishes information, data or facts presented in a picture, text, symbol or any other form in a computer system where such information, data or fact is false, desceptive, misleading or inaccurate commits an offence, and shall on conviction be liable to a fine not less than three million shillings or to imprisonment for a term not less than six months or to both."

The Section threatens online media and makes no reference to social media especially during times of breaking news and developing stories where information may not be fully available or is in the process of being verified. It threatens the core of information sharing as one is not aware of what is truth and what is not.

#### 3. ICT in Governance

The use of ICT creates opportunities for the participation of citizens in decision making processes. As such, Tanzania has undertaken the increased integration of ICT through initiatives that encourage such engagements for citizens.

## 3.1 ICT and Citizen Participation

The formulation of the draft constitution is a popular example that allowed the broad use of ICT in the process of collecting citizens' opinions. ICT tools provided additional means for collecting opinions about the content of the draft Constitution. Although the exercise started in July 2012, lasting a total of 20 months, results show that only 5.8% of opinions were collected through the use of ICT tools as detailed in table 1 below.<sup>20</sup>

Table 1: Methods used in collecting opinions on the new Constitution

Platform	Number of opinions collected	Percentage
Public meetings	323,001	91.8
SMS	8,631	2.5
Email	3,058	0.9
Traditional letters	7,246	2.1
Social networks (Facebook)	2,729	0.8
The website of the Commission	6,703	1.6
Special group meeting	296	0.1

The website of the Parliament of Tanzania provides access to most legislative documents in the history of Tanzania.<sup>21</sup> An information system incorporated into the website provides information about members of the parliament and the contribution they make in parliamentary sessions and proceedings.<sup>22</sup> Further, the website provides a calendar of events, and the relevant timetable, committee reports and bills. The portal also has a section which allows citizens to send questions to the Speaker.

Nevertheless, the portal does not support a live follow-up of parliamentary sessions (by citizens) through providing real-time updates. Also, it does not offer citizens the opportunity

http://www.bungemaalum.go.tz/files/publications/attachments/TAKWIMU ZA UKUSANYAJI WA M AONI YA WANANCHI sw.pdf
<sup>21</sup> Parliament of Tanzania, http://www.parliament.go.tz

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Draft Constitution, Citizens' opinions statistics,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Government of Tanzania, Parliamentary Online Information System, http://newpolis.parliament.go.tz



to discuss various topics arising from the proceedings of parliament. These discussions would help parliamentarians to know the position of citizens in any debated matter within a very short time.

On the other hand, individual politicians have shown initiative in using ICT for citizen participation. Some Members of Parliament (MPs) use social media to share different information (including parliamentary discussions) with their followers. Table 2 presents examples of some politicians engaging in different discussions with citizens through Facebook and Twitter.

Table 2: Examples of MPs with large Facebook Followers

Politician	Platform and Followers as at October 2015	
	Twitter	Facebook
John John Mnyika – MP Ubongo Constituency and	@jjmnyika	John.mnyika
CHADEMA Deputy Secretary General	287,000	40,000
January Makamba – MP Bumbuli Constituency	@jmakamba	JYMakamba
	280,000	202,700
Benard Kamilius Membe- Minister of Foreign Affairs	@BernardMembe	bmembe
	120,000	3,000

Also, a number of private discussion platforms have been set up where citizens share opinions on governance issues. The Jamiiforums.com and Mwanahalisiforum.com are two of such popular forums which allow users to openly discuss governance affairs without fear.

Despite the benefits that citizens get through using these open forums, there have been reports of government authorities cloning these forums and intimidating owners. In a report released by BBC Africa in June 2011, it was claimed that the Jamiiforums website was cloned by the Tanzanian government through malware, and users were unable to access the intended content.<sup>23</sup> Also, the ruling party condemned the forum, accusing it of being "antigovernemnt."<sup>24</sup> However, in April 2011 the forum's hosts reacted with a press release reassuring their members that the allegations were intended to threaten and deter the online community from exercising their freedom of speech and association.<sup>25</sup>

Other citizen discussion platforms include the "Wanazuoni"<sup>26</sup> and "ethinktanktz"<sup>27</sup> that are mostly used for facilitating discussion on ICT, policy and governance. Both of these forums are open Yahoo groups where users subscribe to take part in different discussions. "Wanazuoni" is a Swahili word meaning scholars. The "Wanazuoni" group is an academic platform where different topical issues are discussed with an academic perspective. The "ethinktanktz" is composed of ICT professionals and enthusiats, but is open to other people

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Karen Allen (2011), African jitters over blogs and social media, BBC News, June 11, 2011, http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-13786143

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> FrikaPevu, Political Paranoia? Tanzania's Ruling Party threatens online social media, http://www.fikrapevu.com/political-paranoia-tanzanias-ruling-party-in-fear-of-online-social-media/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Wanazuoni group, Accessed from <a href="https://groups.yahoo.com/neo/groups/wanazuoni/info">https://groups.yahoo.com/neo/groups/wanazuoni/info</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> ICT Professionals (ethinktanktz), Acessed from https://groups.yahoo.com/neo/groups/eThinkTankTz/info



with an interest in ICT trends and policies. In most cases, the same topic may be discussed between the two groups because some members have duo subscription.

Back in 2003, the "ethinktanktz" forum championed the development of the current National ICT Policy. In 2001, members of the forum together with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Tanzania initiated the policy development process, through requesting knowledge resources and support from the government and other stakeholders.<sup>28</sup> The outcome was a document titled "Framework Terms of Reference for National ICT Policy"<sup>29</sup> which was formulated through the collaboration of the ethinktanktz members and the government. The team included members of the forum, academicians, politicians and others. The document served as an input used by the formal government appointed team in policy development.

Online polling is also common in Tanzania. Research institutions and news outlets use ICT tools to get opinions from citizens on different subjects. In the 2010 general election, the Research and Education for Democracy in Tanzania (REDET)<sup>30</sup> and BBC Swahili conducted online polls to establish citizens' perceptions of the contesting candidates. Television stations also allow citizens to send opinions via SMS on topical issues of the day.

## 3.2 ICT and Social Accountability

In 2013, Tanzania became a member of the Open Government Partnership (OGP), which commits the government to be more open, accountable, and responsive to citizens.<sup>31</sup> The Tanzanian government accordingly launched an Open Government Platform (OGP).<sup>32</sup> Other initiatives by the Tanzanian government that support the spirit of the OGP include the establishment of the e-Government Agency (AGA), and Wananchi Portal, which are key in promoting transparency.

The Tanzania Open Data portal is aimed at providing current public information to citizens. Howeber, most of the information contained within is outdated.<sup>33</sup> For example, on the page that presents data for enrolments of children to pre-schools and their associated teachers, the information available was for the year 2012.<sup>34</sup> In the same education section, the number of students with disabilities and their associated teachers in secondary schools is also outdated, with the information from some regions missing.<sup>35</sup> The presence of complete and updated information on the portal would help in financial decision making and informed planning for strategic social actions such as infrastructure development, public health and education improvement.

http://www.opendata.go.tz/dataset/elimu-ya-sekondari/resource/651bf8a8-1755-4c75-858b-790998d46445, accessed on April 9, 2015

 $<sup>^{28}</sup>$  Interview, David Sawe, participant of the 2003 ICT Policy Formulation,  $^{17}$  Jul 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Proposal for Tanzania's ICT Policy Formulation Framework: Final Version, http://www.tzonline.org/pdf/ICTpolicy.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> The Research and Education for Democracy in Tanzania, an affiliate of the University of Dar Es Salaam

<sup>31</sup> Open Government Partnership, http://www.opengovpartnership.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Open Government in Tanzania - <a href="http://www.opengov.go.tz/">http://www.opengov.go.tz/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Government Open Data Portal - <a href="http://www.opendata.go.tz/">http://www.opendata.go.tz/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Open Data Portal, Enrolement in Preschool- <a href="http://www.opendata.go.tz/dataset/elimu-ya-awali">http://www.opendata.go.tz/dataset/elimu-ya-awali</a>, accessed on April 9, 2015

<sup>35</sup> Government Open Data Portal, Students with Disabilities -



In 2007, then president Jakaya Kikwete directed the Ministry of Information, Culture and Sports to develop an online portal that connects the government with its citizens – the Wananchi Portal.<sup>36</sup> The portal was developed with the intention to receive complaints about poorly delivered government services. The complaints are then directed to the relevant government authority, which is obliged to issue responses to citizens. While conducting this study, the main statistical information that we managed to obtain (from the Public Relations Officer of the Department of Information) was that the government had received about 70,000 complaints by June 2013. No further information on responsiveness could be established on the website.

The portal also faces a technical challenge of lacking mechanisms to trace processes through which an information request submitted by a citizen goes through. The current tracing tool does not inform the applicant what at specific stage the inquiry is. It is necessary to define the sequence of stages and the expected duration of execution for each stage. Moreover, the incorporation of the identity of the personnel currently addressing the submitted request would ensure transparency while providing the room for accountability.

Another initiative is the E-Government Agency (EGA) under the Ministry of Public Services that seeks to bring more government services online.<sup>37</sup> The agency, which was established in 2011 aims to network government institutions to allow free flow of information, centralise the government email system, register web addresses for government institutions, and coordinate the implementation of the ICT policy objectives among government institutions. Currently, the agency has developed the centralised government email system and almost all government MDAs own a web address. However, some of the websites are without recent or regularly updated content. In an interview with clients who visited one public office to submit letters with different requests, it was generally established that clients were reluctant to use government e-mail systems because it is characterised by low/no response from attendants.

Similarly, in 2013, the EGA developed a bilingual (English and Swahili) one stop portal for all public services in Tanzania – the tanzania.go.tz portal. The portal provides access to government information including on socioeconomic matters such as legal, agricultural, manufacturing, water, education, employment, health, forestry and land use, among others. The website offers links to online forms and e-services provided by various authorities such as passport control and immigration, tax registration and payments, social security status as well as utility services billing and payments. It further offers a facility for receiving feedback from users on different services offered.

Although much of the provided information on Tanzania.go.tz is useful and current, this study observed that some of the links were lacking content.<sup>38</sup> The absence of some web content on the central government portal denies citizens (who rely on online media) the right to information. Arguably, it is necessary to develop a mechanism to enforce accountability among key players who are responsible for updating the content of the portal. Tanzania currently has no Access to Infoprmation law that would enable citizens to demand information and increased responsiveness from governemnt bodies.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Wananchi Portal – <u>www.wananchi.go.tz</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> E-Governance Agency Web Address – http://www.ega.go.tz

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Before April 9, 2015, the following links within the portal were lacking content: The like for Livestock, Fisheries, Manufacturing, mineral, and Energy,



The Tanzanian government also developed an e-tax system in 2011 that allows citizens to register, send and receive tax assessments online.<sup>39</sup>

Together with efforts shown in ensuring the use of ICT in service provision, there is a need for civic organisations to establish systems that can monitor services provided by government entities. This will raise the awareness necessary in the process of enforcing accountability. Generally, this study found that in many areas of service provision such as water, electricity, health services and education, there were no private organisations with a well-established online system that monitors the adequacy of services provided to clients. Consumers remained reliant on traditional methods of monitoring services offered by the government.

#### 3.3 ICT in Politics

Tanzanians are increasingly embracing use of ICT platforms for polictical dialogue. Major political parties own websites where they share basic information with supporters although with limited levels of interactivity with site visitors.

Mobile phones have also been used for citizen mobilisation in political affairs as experienced during the 2010 general election campaigns where presidential candidates used mobile phones to request support from potential voters. <sup>40</sup> In addition, social media is being used by political leaders to share information about their political campaigns. Table 3 presents select political parties' online presence.

Table 3: Select Political Parties Online Presence and Statistics as at October 2015

Political Parter	CHADEMA	CCM	CUF	Others
Website	http://chadema.or.tz	http://ccm.or.tz/	http://www.cuf.or.tz	Parties like the
			/	National
Twitter Handle	@ChademaMedia	@ccm_tanzania	@civicunited	Convention for
and No. Of	32 000	76 500	200	Construction and
followers				Reform -Mageuzi
Facebook Page	https://www.facebook.co	https://www.facebook.co	https://www.faceboo	(NCCR-Mageuzi),
and No. of	m/CHADEMAMedia/	m/tanzaniaccm/	k.com/The-Civic-	United
"Likes"	27 500	220 000 (Friends)	United-Front-CUF/	Democratic Party,
			2,000 likes	and the Civic
Youtube	https://www.youtube.co	https://www.youtube.com		United Front
	m/user/chadematv	/channel/UC-		showed very
	6080 subscribers	vpGdriI45LJMLBkU_wXYQ/		limited/outdated
		about		online presence
		962 subscribers		
Other	Disapora blog	Diaspora blog		
	http://chademadiaspora.	http://ccmchama.blogspot		
	blogspot.com	.com		

<sup>40</sup>President Kikwete used text messages for campaigns in 2010, http://allafrica.com/stories/201011080264.html

10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> TRA Online tax assessment, <a href="http://www.tra.go.tz/index.php/2012-11-20-06-36-46/112-motor-vehicles/220-mfumo-mpya-wa-kulipia-ada-za-magari-kwa-njia-ya-mtandao">http://www.tra.go.tz/index.php/2012-11-20-06-36-46/112-motor-vehicles/220-mfumo-mpya-wa-kulipia-ada-za-magari-kwa-njia-ya-mtandao</a>



Civil society organisations have also been active in using ICT in monitoring political activities. During the 2010 general election, online platforms such as the Uchaguzi<sup>41</sup> and the Tzelect<sup>42</sup> were established. These platforms collected information from citizens about the trends of the elections. The Tzelect platform enabled citizens to submit information by sending emails using the address tzelect@gmail.com, twitter (#TZelect) and filling an online form. Meanwhile Uchaguzi used the email address elections.tz@gmail.com, twitter hashtag (#uchaguzi), an online form and text messages shortcode 15540 for all telecommunication companies. Unfortunately the two platforms were introduced shortly before the election, and may have not gained adequate popularity in time.

In the 2015 elections, a crowdsourcing portal <a href="http://www.uchaguzitanzania.co.tz">http://www.uchaguzitanzania.co.tz</a>, and twitter hashtag #uchaguzi2015 were created to provide centralised information about the elections. 43

## 3.4. ICT, Human Rights and Law Enforcement

Sections 12-24 of Tanzania's Constitution guarantee citizens various rights, including the right to equality, life, freedom of conscience, work, freedom of expression and freedom of communication. Pursuant to the Constitution was the establishment of the Commission of Human Rights and Good Governance (CHRAGG), an independant institution to monitor human rights abuse and to promote good governance. However, the commission is unable to reach all parts of Tanzania due to limited resources.<sup>44</sup>

To address this challenge of inadequate resources, in 2012, the commission launched the 'SMS for Human Rights' system that enables reporting of human rights violations to the commission through text message. To promote the use of the system and greater respect for human rights, the commission spearheaded an awareness campaign targeting 16 regions of Tanzania. In 2012/2013, a total of 1,545 human rights violations were reported to the commission. Of these, 900 cases were reported through text messages. CHRAGG guarantees responses to reports of human rights violations within 21 days.

Another initiative by the government of Tanzania is the Jeshi La Polisi run by the Police Force, which allows citizens to report crimes through their website. Reports are received by the Police Force through its information desk, where information is analysed and documented before being forwarded to the Director of Criminal Investigation (DCI). Decisions by the DCI are communicated to the reporting citizen through email, phone call or any other method deemed appropriate in addressing the incident. However, in an interview with the Police Officer In-charge of the Temeke District Police Centre, it emerged that the online reporting system was reliant on manual paperwork in internal operations and may lead to delayed responses when key police personnel are not in the office.

Also, the Police Force has an emergency response unit with mobile phone numbers [+255(0)787668306 and +255 (0)222138177] which provide quick responses to reported crimes through broadcasting the received information to all Police Stations and nearby

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> The official website of the uchaguzi platform- www.uchaguzi.or.tz

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> The link to the form provided by the tzelect - <a href="http://vijanafm.crowdmap.com/reports/submit/">http://vijanafm.crowdmap.com/reports/submit/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Uchaguzi Tanzania, http://www.uchaguzitanzania.co.tz/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Interview, CHRAGG Officer on Duty, 25 July 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Interview, CHRAGG Research Officer, 25 July 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Tanzania Police Force, <a href="http://policeforce.go.tz/index.php/sw/julisha-uhalifu">http://policeforce.go.tz/index.php/sw/julisha-uhalifu</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Interview, Police Officer Incharge, Temeke District Police Centre, 20 July 2014



Police services in Dar Es Salaam through Radio Calls.<sup>48</sup> Despite these efforts, police operations are occasionally characterised by brutality<sup>49</sup> and corruption. According to the 2013 East Africa Bribery Index (EABI) report, the Police Force is reported as the most corrupt public organisation in Tanzania and in the region.<sup>50</sup>

# 4. Challenges to the Use of ICT in Governance

Besides existing legislation which limits the widespread use of ICT in enhancing good governance, this study noted the following challenges that hamper the potential of ICT in engaging citizens and improving governance in Tanzania.

## i.) Poor Content Management Practices

Parallel to the establishment of network infrastructure to ensure connectivity, the government has the responsibility of adding relevant content to its portals. Indeed, Section 3.3.3 (viii) of the ICT policy acknowledges that the underdevelopment of local content is among the key challenges in the effective utilisation of infrastructure.<sup>51</sup>

An assessment of government portals found that they often contain information on political activities rather than information that meets the needs of citizens. For example, in the period of May to September 2014, the website for Ministry of Agriculture, Food Securities and Cooperatives<sup>52</sup> remained offline, depriving citizens of the opportunity to source information about weather, pesticides and market prices. In comparison, the Tanzania Revenue Authority website<sup>53</sup> relays most of the information and services offered by the authority to citizens online. It offers electronic methods for communication, self tax registration, tax assessment and other information necessary in filing tax returns.

#### ii.) The Use of Foreign Language

Swahili is Tanzania's national language, and Section 3.9.3 (vi) of the National ICT policy recommends that the national language be adequately used in technological communications.<sup>54</sup> This would ensure the availability of information relevant to local people, and provide citizens the opportunity to interact and communicate with each other comfortably. However, government ministries, departments and agencies more often than not use English on their websites and in documents. The dominant use of English paralyses citizens' ability to easily access and use information on governance related issues. Some institutions address this challenge through developing websites with bilingual content, such as the e-governance portal.<sup>55</sup> and the Tanzanian government central portal.<sup>56</sup>

## iii.) Access for persons with disabilities

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Interview, Police Officer Incharge, Temeke District Police Centre, 20 July 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> For example the death of Daudi Mwangosi, the Journalist in Iringa in the CHADEMA meeting; Report by Media Council - <a href="http://www.mct.or.tz/index.php/downloads/category/20-lnvestigative%20Reports?download=65:report-daudi-mwangosis-killing">http://www.mct.or.tz/index.php/downloads/category/20-lnvestigative%20Reports?download=65:report-daudi-mwangosis-killing</a>

Report Says Tanzanian Police the Most Corrupt in East Africa,
http://www.africareview.com/News/Report-says-Tanzanian-police-the-most-corrupt-in-East-Africa/-/979180/2051704/-/dc2egd/-/index html

<sup>/979180/2051704/-/</sup>dc2egd/-/index.html 
<sup>51</sup> Policy Challenge, "To Development of local content"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Ministry of Agriculture, http://www.agriculture.go.tz/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Tanzania Revenue Authority, www.tra.go.tz

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Policy Challenge, "Using the Kiswahili language for content creation."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> E-governance Portal, www.ega.go.tz

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Tanzania Government Central Portal, http://tanzania.go.tz/



Related to the language findings above, local websites are not equipped to address issues related to physical limitations of some citizens. No content provisions are made for the hearing or vision impaired. This is perhaps due to the lack of a national policy on government website standards.

- iv.) Inadequate Coordination in the Implementation of Policy Objectives

  Section 3.2.2 (g) of the National ICT Policy (2003) requires the establishment of an organ to manage the policy implementation process. This organ would harmonise efforts and activities undertaken by various institutions to ensure that the policy is updated, and that implementation strategies and plans are drawn and carried out in the most efficient and effective manner. The organ would also lead to the formulation of acts and regulations for implementing policy objectives. However, it was only in April 2011 that the e-Government Agency was entrusted with this role yet it lacks the supporting legislation that gives it the mandate to enforce accountability to other public institutions. As a result, it is difficult for the agency to hold accountable those who do not meet the desired standard of ICT implementation in government platforms.
- v.) Untimely Review of the ICT Policy and other Related Legislations

  The policy review cycle varies depending on the review scope. It has been suggested that changes in government's administrative focus and changes in technology require a more regular review (at least every three years) of the national ICT policy (Lubua, 2014). This would ensure that technological changes and recent innovations are accommodated into the policy within time. Since its enactment in 2003, the National ICT policy has not been reviewed. Over the past 11 years, there have been numerous developments in the information technology field which need policy reconsideration. For instance, the policy needs to be revised to recognise the presence of government agencies that support its operation, but were instituted later. It also requires changes to address contemporary issues such as intermediary liability, cybercrime, privacy and data protection.

## vi.) Low User Awareness

Awareness is required for people to make the right decision on what method to use in acquiring services from government institutions. Although many Tanzanians are aware of benefits associated with online services, others are not sure whether government online systems facilitate such services. Many Tanzanians use mobile phones mainly for communication, while a few extend the use in supporting some financial services. Very few are using the technology in seeking information from government agencies. As indicated earlier, during the collection of citizens' opinions about the draft Constitution, only 5.8% of citizen opinions were collected through electronic means<sup>58</sup> despite the country having over 50% mobile phone penetration rate.

## 5. Recommendations

Despite the efforts of the Tanzania Government including the formulation of policies and legislations which demonstrate the importance of using ICT in governance, more gaps than successes remain present.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Create an authoritative national organization to effect, coordinate and review the ICT policy

Takwimu kura ya maoni ya Wananchi juu ya katiba http://www.bungemaalum.go.tz/files/publications/attachments/TAKWIMU\_ZA\_UKUSANYAJI\_WA\_M AONI\_YA\_WANANCHI\_sw.pdf



Freedom of expression including media freedom and access to information by citizens are grossly affected by retrogressive legislations. Therefore, there is a need to amend legislative articles that inhibit the use of ICT for more transparent and participatory governance. These articles affect operations of the media, civil society and citizen journalists. It is on this basis that the following is recommended:

- i.) The amendment of Section 5 (1)<sup>59</sup> of the National Security Act (1970) which classifies government information, and gives the government power to decide what type of information should be communicated to citizens about government activities. This section contradicts the constitution article that recognises the right to information by citizens, which is fundamental for transparency, accountability and good governance.
- ii.) Amendement of Section 25 (1)<sup>60</sup> of the Newspapers Act (1976). The law grants the Minister the power to stop operations of a media outlet based on her/his own opinion that the public interest is affected. The amendment should allow for an oversight role and appeals mechanisms.
- iii.) Adopt a new ICT policy. This policy should describe the mandate of its coordinating body (e-Government Agency) and specify the maximum period of time before the policy is reviewed. All government bodies should reflect ICT policy objectives in their operations.
- iv.) Tanzania government should prioritise the incorporation of ICT use in its organs in order to enable more civic participation in governance activities. To this end, there is need to make all government website more interactive to allow for citizen feedback on information shared. Furthermore, government departments need to embrace new online platforms such as social networking tools like Facebook, Twitter and YouTube to increase their engagement with citizens.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Any person who communicates any classified matter to any person other than a person to whom he is authorized to communicate it, shall be guilty of an offence.

 $<sup>^{60}</sup>$  Where the Minister is of the opinion that it is in the public interest or in the interest of peace and good order- s/he may direct that the newspaper named in the order shall cease publication -



#### References

- Commonwealth Observers. (2010). Tanzania General Election. Common Wealth Secretariat.
- Draft Constitution Report. (2013). *Takwimu ya Ukusanyaji maoni ya wananchi Kuhusu Mabadiliko ya Katiba ya Jamhuri ya Muungano wa Tanzania*. Dar Es Salaam: Government of Tanzania.
- Kiknadze, G. (2007). *E-Governance and e-Transparency.* Tbilisi: Institute for Development of Freedom of Information.
- Lubua, E. (2014). *Adoption of E-Transparency in the Public Sector of Tanzania*. Durban: University of KwaZulu Natal.
- Lubua, E., & Maharaj, M. (2012). ICT Policy & E-transparency in Tanzania Public Sector. *IST-Africa 2012 Conference Proceedings*. Dar es Salaam: IIMC International Information Management Corporation,.
- Ministry of Information, Sports & Culture. (2014). *Financial Budget*. Dodoma: The Parliament of Tanzania.
- Nchunge, D. M., Sakwa, M., & Mwangi, W. (2012). User's Perception on ICT Adoption For Education Support in Schools: A Survey of Secondary School Teacher's in Thika District Kenya. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, Vol 2, No10.
- Rodrigo, A. (2011). Mobile phones in Tanzania: tools for social change? Glocal Times.



# Collaboration on International ICT Policy in East and Southern Africa (CIPESA)

156-158 Mutesa II Road, Ntinda, P.O Box 4365 Kampala-Uganda. Tel: +256 414 289 502; Mobile: +256 790 860 084, +256 712 204 335.

Email: programmes@cipesa.org
Twitter: @cipesaug Facebook: facebook.com/cipesaug

www.cipesa.org